

B = Stephen Batchelor? (according to internet site)

SB = Stephen Batchelor: VERSES FROM THE CENTER: A BUDDHIST VISION OF THE SUBLIME (New York: Riverhead Books, 2000)

S = Frederick J. Streng, EMPTINESS: A STUDY IN RELIGIOUS MEANING (New York: Abingdon Press, 1967), Appendix A & B; pp. 183-227

G = Jay L. Garfield, THE FUNDAMENTAL WISDOM OF THE MIDDLE WAY: NAGARAJUNA'S MULAMDHYAMAKAKARIKA (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995)

I = Kenneth K. Inada, NAGARJUNA: A TRANSLATION OF HIS MULAMADHYAMAKAKARIKA WITH AN INTRODUCTORY ESSAY (Tokyo: The Hokuseido Press, 1970)

K= David J. Kalupahana, MULAMADHYAMAKAKARIKA OF NAGARJUNA: THE PHILOSOPHY OF THE MIDDLE WAY (Albany, NY: SUNY Press, 1986)

For an English translation of the karikas (virtually identical with G above) together with Je Tsongkhapa's commentary on them, consult Ngawang Samten and Jay L. Garfield (trans.), OCEAN OF REASONING: A GREAT COMMENTARY ON NAGARJUNA'S MULAMADHYAMAKAKARIKA (NY: Oxford University Press, 2006)

मूलमध्यमकारिका आर्यनागार्जुनस्य

कर्मफलपरीक्षा नाम सप्तदशमं प्रकरणं

B: Investigation of Actions and Fruits (Acts)

SB: Acts

S: An Analysis of Action (karma) and Its Product (phala) (action and its results)

G: Examination of Actions and Their Fruits

I: Examination of Action and Its Effect

K: Examination of the Fruit of Action

धर्मस्य साधनोपायाः शुक्लाः कर्मपथा दश ।

फलं कामगुणाः पञ्च धर्मस्य प्रेत्य चेह च ॥ ११

B: The ten paths of white action are the means of practising Dharma. Here and elsewhere, the fruits of Dharma are the five kinds of sensual qualities.

SB: No killing and no stealing, no abusing and no lying, no slandering, swearing, gossiping, no coveting, resenting or fixating: these pristine acts are ways to practice that ripen as beauty and pleasure, here and elsewhere.

S: The ten pure "paths of action" are means for realizing the dharma.

And the five qualities of desired objects [i.e., desire to know the form, sound, odor, taste, and touch of existence] are fruits (phala) of the dharma both now and after death.

G: The ten pure paths of action are the method of realizing the Dharma. These fruits of the Dharma in this and other lives are the five pleasures.

I: The ten paths of pure action are the means of realizing the dharma. The effects (i.e. fruits) of the dharma of this as well as the next realm of life are the five sensual enjoyments.

K: The ten pure paths of action are the means of achieving good. The five strands of sense pleasure represent the fruit of good, here as well as in the next life.

.

बहवश्च महान्तश्च दोषाः स्युरपि कल्पना ।

यद्येषा तेन नैवैषा कल्पनात्रोपपद्यते ॥ १२

B: If it were as that investigation, many great mistakes would occur. Therefore, that investigation is not valid here.

S: There would be many great mistakes if that explanation [were accepted].
Therefore, that explanation is not possible.

G: If such an analysis were advanced, there would be many great errors. Therefore, this analysis is not tenable here.

I: If conceptualizations are permitted there will arise many as well as great errors.
Therefore, they are not permissible (or possible) here.

K: If there were to be such a thought, there would be many a great error. Therefore, such a thought is not appropriate here.

इमां पुनः प्रवक्ष्यामि कल्पनां यात्र योज्यते ।

बुद्धैः प्रत्येकबुद्धैश्च श्रावकैश्चानुवर्णितां ॥ १३

B: I will fully declare the investigation which is taught by the Buddhas, Pratyekabuddhas and Sravakas, which is valid here.

S: In rebuttal I will explain the interpretation which can be made to fit [the facts],
That which is followed by the Buddha, the self-sufficient enlightened ones
(pratyekabuddha) and the disciples [of Buddha].

G: I will then explain what is tenable here: The analysis propounded by all Buddhas,
self-conquerors and disciples according to which. . .

I: I will here relate about certain appropriate conceptualizations which have been praised
(i.e. sanctioned) by the Buddhas, Pratyekabuddhas, and Shravakas.

K: Moreover, I shall expound the following thought which is appropriate and which has
been extolled by the Buddhas, the self-enlightened ones and the disciples.

.

पत्रं यथाऽविप्रणाशस्तथर्णमिव कर्म च ।

चतुर्विधो धातुतः स प्रकृत्याऽव्याकृतश्च सः ॥ १४

B: Just like a contract, irrevocable action is like a debt. In terms of realms, there are four
types. Moreover, its nature is unspecified.

SB: Acts, like contracts, are as irrevocable as debts – their irrevocability ensures fruition.

S: As "that which is imperishable" is like a credit [on an account statement], so an action
(karma) is like a debt.

[The imperishable is] of four kinds in its elements (dhatu) [i.e., desire, form, non-form,
and pure]; in its essential nature it cannot be analyzed.

G: Action is like an uncanceled promissory note and like a debt. Of the realms it is
fourfold. Moreover, its nature is neutral.

I: An imperishable continuing action is like a document (i.e. in constant force) and a
karman is like an obligation (i.e. a discharge of duty). The imperishable continuing
action is four-fold from the standpoint of the realms of action (dhatu) and is
indeterminate from the standpoint of primal substance (prakrti).

K: Like an imperishable promissory note, so is debt as well as action. It is fourfold in terms of realms and indeterminate in terms of primal nature.

प्रहाणतो न प्रहेयो भावनाहेय एव वा ।

तस्मादविप्रणाशेन जायते कर्मणां फलं ॥ १५

B: It is not let go of by letting go, but only let go of by cultivation. Therefore through irrevocability are the fruits of acts produced.

SB: Only patient cultivation frees you from their grip – insight by itself is insufficient.

S: [An imperishable force] is not destroyed qua destruction; rather it is destroyed according to spiritual discipline.

Therefore, the fruit of actions originates by the imperishable force.

G: By abandoning, that is not abandoned. Abandonment occurs through meditation. Therefore, through the nonexpired, the fruit of action arises.

I: It (i.e. the imperishable continuing action) is not abandoned by simple abandonment but by the virtuous practical actions. Therefore, the fruits of karman come forth from the imperishable continuing action.

K: That [i.e., the imperishable karma] would not be relinquished by simple relinquishing. It is to be relinquished only through cultivation. Thus, through the imperishable arises the fruit of action.

प्रहाणतः प्रहेयः स्यात्कर्मणः संक्रमेण वा ।

यदि दोषाः प्रसज्येरंस्तत्र कर्मवधादयः ॥ १६

B: If it perished through being let go of by letting go and the transcendence of the action, then faults would follow such as the perishing of actions.

SB: Were acts transcended by understanding – insight itself would destroy them.

S: If [the imperishable force] were that which is destroyed by [usual] destruction or by transference of action,

Fallacies [like] the destruction of action would logically result.

G: If abandonment occurred through abandoning, and if action were destroyed through transformation, the destruction of action, etc., and other errors would arise.

I: If it is abandoned by simple abandonment or by the transformation of the karman, then there necessarily follows such errors as the denial of karman, etc.

K: If it is to be relinquished through simple relinquishing or through the transformation of action, then there would follow a variety of errors such as the destruction of actions.

सर्वेषां विषभागानां सभागानां च कर्मणां ।

प्रतिसंधौ सधातूनामेक उत्पद्यते तु सः ॥ १७

B: The very [irrevocability] of all actions in similar or dissimilar realms, that one alone is born when crossing the boundary [i.e. reborn].

SB: Irrevocability alone survives the vexed transition from one life to the next.

S: At the moment of transition that [imperishable force]
Of all identical and different actions belonging to the same element (dhatu) originates.

G: From all these actions in a realm, whether similar or dissimilar, at the moment of birth only one will arise.

I: When all the similar and dissimilar karmans come together in a realm, there will arise only one imperishable continuing action.

K: Of all these actions, whether dissimilar or similar, belonging to certain realms, only one would arise at the moment of birth [of a being].

कर्मणः कर्मणो दृष्टे धर्म उत्पद्यते तु सः ।

द्विप्रकारस्य सर्वस्य विपक्वऽपि च तिष्ठति ॥ १८

B: In the visible world there are two kinds. Actions of all [types] and that [irrevocability] of actions are produced as different things and remain [so?] even on ripening.

S: That [imperishable force] is the dharma, having arisen by one action after another in visible existence;

And it remains [constant] even in the development of all bifurcating action.

G: In this visible world, all actions of the two kinds, each comprising action and the unexpired separately, will remain while ripening.

I: The imperishable continuing action will arise in the present, correspondingly with respect to all the two-fold nature (i.e. similar and dissimilar) of the karmans. It will also endure in its maturing state.

K: that [imperishable] arises in the present life, corresponding to all the actions having dual natures [similar and dissimilar, good and bad, etc.] and stays so even when matured.

फलव्यतिक्रमाद्वा स मरणाद्वा निरुध्यते ।

अनास्रवं सास्रवं च विभागं तत्र लक्षयेत् ॥ १९

B: When the fruit is transcendent and when one dies, that ceases. One should know its divisions to be without-corruption and with-corruption.

S: That [imperishable force] is destroyed by death and by avoiding the product (phala) . There the difference is characterized as impure and pure.

G: That fruit, if extinction or death occurs, ceases. Regarding this, a distinction between the stainless and the stained is drawn.

I: The imperishable continuing action ceases to be when it has gone beyond (i.e.,exhausted) the effects or met with death. Here a distinction must be made between worldly attachments (sasrava) and supra- worldly non-attachments (anasrava)

K: That [imperishable] ceases as result of the interruption of the fruit or as a result of death. Herein, a distinction between one with influxes and the one without influxes is to be signified.

शून्यता च न चोच्छेदः संसारश्च न शाश्वतं ।

कर्मणोऽविप्रणाशश्च धर्मो बुद्धेन देशितः ॥ २०

B: Emptiness is not annihilation and samsara is not permanent. The dharma of the irrevocability of actions is taught by the Buddha.

SB: Emptiness does not negate it; life does not set it in stone.

S: "Emptiness," "no annihilation," existence-in-flux, "non-eternity,"
And the imperishable reality of action: such was the teaching taught by the Buddha.

G: Emptiness and non-annihilation; cyclic existence and non-permance: that action is non-expiring is taught by the Buddha.

I: The imperishable continuing action spoken by the Buddha is shunyata and not uccheda (interruption), samsara and not shashvata (constancy).

K: Emptiness, however, is not annihilation; life-process is also not eternal; the imperishability is of action – such is the doctrine taught by the Buddha.