

B = Stephen Batchelor? (according to internet site)

SB = Stephen Batchelor: VERSES FROM THE CENTER: A BUDDHIST VISION OF THE SUBLIME (New York: Riverhead Books, 2000)

S = Frederick J. Streng, EMPTINESS: A STUDY IN RELIGIOUS MEANING (New York: Abingdon Press, 1967), Appendix A & B; pp. 183-227

G = Jay L. Garfield, THE FUNDAMENTAL WISDOM OF THE MIDDLE WAY: NAGARAJUNA'S MULAMDHYAMAKAKARIKA (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995)

I = Kenneth K. Inada, NAGARJUNA: A TRANSLATION OF HIS MULAMADHYAMAKAKARIKA WITH AN INTRODUCTORY ESSAY (Tokyo: The Hokuseido Press, 1970)

K= David J. Kalupahana, MULAMADHYAMAKAKARIKA OF NAGARJUNA: THE PHILOSOPHY OF THE MIDDLE WAY (Albany, NY: SUNY Press, 1986)

For an English translation of the karikas (virtually identical with G above) together with Je Tsongkhapa's commentary on them, consult Ngawang Samten and Jay L. Garfield (trans.), OCEAN OF REASONING: A GREAT COMMENTARY ON NAGARJUNA'S MULAMADHYAMAKAKARIKA (NY: Oxford University Press, 2006)

मूलमध्यमकारिका आर्यनागार्जुनस्य

कर्मकारकपरीक्षा नामाष्टमं प्रकरणं

B: "Investigation of Act and Actor (Actors)"

S: "An Analysis of the Product (Karma) and the Producer (Karaka) (action and agent) "

G: "Examination of the Agent and Action"

I: "Examination of the Doer and the Deed"

N: "Examination of the Agent and Action"

K: "Examination of Action and the Agent"

सद्भूतः कारकः कर्म सद्भूतं न करोत्ययं ।

कारको नाप्यसद्भूतः कर्मासद्भूतमीहिते ॥ १

B: One who exists as an actor does not do that which exists as an act. One who does not exist as an actor also does not do that which does not exist as an act.

SB: Real actors do not perform real acts, nor unreal actors unreal acts.

S: A real producer does not produce a real product.

Even more so, a non-real producer does not seek a non-real product.

G: This existent agent does not perform an existent action. Nor does some nonexistent agent perform some nonexistent action.

I: A doer in a completed state cannot create a deed in a completed state. Again, a doer in an incompleted state cannot create a deed in an incompleted state.

K: This really existent agent does not perform a really existent action. Neither is it intended that a really non-existent agent performs a really non-existent action.

सद्भूतस्य क्रिया नास्ति कर्म च स्यादकर्तृकम् ।

सद्भूतस्य क्रिया नास्ति कर्ता च स्यादकर्मकः ॥ २

B: One who exists has no activity; [something] would also exist as an act without an actor. One who exists has no activity; [something] would also exist as an actor without an act.

SB: Real actors are inactive; real acts need no actors.

S: There is no producing action of a real thing; [if so,] there would be a product without someone producing.

Also, there is no producing by a real thing; [if so,] there would be someone producing without something produced.

G: An existent entity has no activity. There would also be action without an agent. An existent entity has no activity. There would also be agent without action.

I: When a doer is in a completed state, there will be no doing and also a deed will be without a doer. Likewise, when a deed is in a completed state, there will be no doing and also a doer will be without a deed.

K: A really existent entity has no activity. Therefore, action would be without an agent. A really existent entity has no activity. Therefore, even an agent would be without action.

करोति यद्यसद्भूतोऽसद्भूतं कर्म कारकः ।

अहेतुकं भवेत्कर्म कर्ता चाहेतुको भवेत् ॥ ३

B: If one who does not exist as an actor did that which does not exist as an act, the act would have no cause; the actor too would have no cause.

SB: Real actors do not perform unreal acts, nor unreal actors real acts. Unreal acts and unreal actors need no causes.

S: If a non-existent producer would produce a non-real product,
The product would be without a causal source and the producer would be without a causal source.

G: If a nonexistent agent were to perform a nonexistent action, then the action would be without a cause and the agent would be without a cause.

I: If a doer in an incompleated state creates a deed in an incompleated state, then (in actuality) the deed will be without a cause and the doer will (in itself) have no cause.

K: If a non-existent agent were to perform a non-existent action, the action would be without a cause, and the agent too would be without a cause.

हेतावसति कार्यं च कारणं च न विद्यते ।

तदभावे क्रिया कर्ता करणं च न विद्यते ॥ ४

B: If there were no cause, effect and cause would not be evident. If they were non-existent, activity and agent and doing would not be evident.

SB: No causes, no causality. No causality, no activity, actors or performance.

S: If there is no causal source, there is nothing to be produced nor cause-in-general (karana).

Then neither do the producing action, the person producing, nor the instrument of production (karana) exist.

G: Without a cause, the effect and its cause will not occur. Without this, activity and agent and action are not possible.

I: Without a cause, there can be no effect or an efficient cause. Without these (effect and cause), there can be no functions of doing, doer, and deed.

K: When a cause does not exist, both the effect and the sufficient condition are not evident. When these are non-existent, activity, agent and performance of action are also not evident.

धर्माधर्मौ न विद्येते क्रियादीनामसंभवे ।

धर्मं चासत्यधर्मं च फलं तज्जं न विद्यते ॥ ५

B: If activity etc. did not appear, dharma and adharma would not be evident. If dharma and adharma did not exist, there would be no fruit that comes from them.

SB: No performance, no good and bad. No good and bad, no fruits of good and bad.

S: If the producing action, etc. do not exist, then neither can the true reality (dharma) nor false reality (adharma) exist.

If neither the true reality nor the false reality exists, then also the product (phala) born from that does not exist.

G: If activity, etc., are not possible, entities and nonentities are not possible. If there are neither entities nor nonentities, effects cannot arise from them.

I: Without these functions, etc. (doer, deed), there can be no factors (dharma) and non-factors (adharma) of experience. Without factors and non-factors there can be nothing arising out of them.

K: When the non-occurrence of activity, etc., good and bad are also not evident. When both good and bad do not exist, a fruit arising from these would also not be evident.

फलेऽसति न मोक्षाय न स्वर्गायोपपद्यते ।

मार्गः सर्वक्रियाणां च नैरर्थक्यं प्रसज्यते ॥ ६

B: If there were no fruit, the path of liberation and higher states would not be appropriate. Also it would follow that all activities are meaningless.

SB: No fruits of good and bad, no way to heaven. No way to heaven, no way to freedom.

S: If there is no real product, then there also exists no path to heaven nor to ultimate release.

Thus it logically follows that all producing actions are without purpose.

G: If there are no effects, liberation and paths to higher realms will not exist. So all of activity would be without purpose.

I: When there is no effect there will be no way of arriving at liberation or the heavens. For all doings or functions will fall into purposelessness.

K: When the fruit does not exist, the path of release or of heaven is not appropriate. This would imply the futility of all activity.

कारकः सदसद्भूतः सदसत्कुरुते न तत् ।

परस्परविरुद्धं हि सच्चासच्चैकतः कुतः ॥ ७

B: One who exists and does not exist as an actor does not do what exists and does not exist [as an act]. Since existence and non-existence are mutually contradictory in one [thing], where can they exist?

S: And a real-nonreal producer does not produce in a real-nonreal manner.

For, indeed, how can "real" and "non-real," which are mutually contradictory, occur in one place?

G: An existent and nonexistent agent does not perform an existent and nonexistent action. Existence and nonexistence cannot pertain to the same thing. For how could they exist together?

I: A completed-incomplete doer cannot create a completed-incomplete deed. For how could the mutually conflicting completed and incompleting states co-exist as one?

K: An agent who is both existent and non-existent does not perform an action that is both existent and non-existent, for they are self-contradictory. Where can existence and non-existence co-exist?

सता च क्रियते नासन्नासता क्रियते च सत् ।

कर्त्रा सर्वे प्रसज्यन्ते दोषास्तत्र त एव हि ॥ ८

B: One who exists as an actor does not do an act which is not existent. One who does not exist [as an actor] also does not do what exists [as an act]. Here too faults will follow for one.

S: A real producer (kartra) does not produce what is non-real, and a non-real producer does not produce what is real.

[From that] indeed, all the mistakes must logically follow.

G: An actual agent does not perform a nonactual action. Nor by a nonactual one is an actual one performed. From this, all of those errors would follow.

I: A completed doer cannot create an incompleated deed nor can an incompleated doer create a completed deed. For (if the above conditions are not accepted) then all fallacies will follow.

K: A non-existent action is not performed by a presently existing agent. Nor is an existent action performed by a presently non-existent agent. Indeed, if that were to be the case, all errors relating to the agents [mentioned earlier] would follow.

नासद्भूतं न सद्भूतः सदसद्भूतमेव वा ।

करोति कारकः कर्म पूर्वोक्तैरेव हेतुभिः ॥ ९

B: One who exists as an actor does not do what does not exist as an act and what neither exists or not [as an act], because of what was demonstrated by the proof above.

S: The producer, who is neither real nor non-real, does not produce a product which is either real or non-real,

Because of the reasons which have been advanced earlier.

G: An existent agent does not perform an action that is unreal or both real and unreal as we have already agreed.

I: A completed doer cannot create an incompleated deed nor that of a completed-incompleated deed. This is according to the reason expounded in previous verses (i.e., verses 2 and 3).

K: For reasons stated above, an agent who has come to be existent does not perform an action that is non-existent or both existent and non-existent.

नासद्भूतोऽपि सद्भूतं सदसद्भूतमेव वा ।

करोति कारकः कर्म पूर्वोक्तैरेव हेतुभिः ॥ १०

B: One who does not exist as an actor does not do what exists as an act and what neither exists or not [as an act], because of what was demonstrated by the proof above.

SB: Unreal real actors do not perform real unreal acts. Reality and unreality cancel each other out.

S: The non-real producer does not produce a product which is not real, nor both real-and-non-real,

Because of the reasons which have been advanced earlier.

G: A nonexistent agent does not perform an action that is unreal or both real and unreal as we have already agreed.

I: An incompleter doer also cannot create a completed deed nor that of a completed-incompleter deed. This is according to the reason expounded in the previous verses (i.e., verses 4,5, and 6).

K: For reasons stated above, an agent who has come to be non-existent does not perform an action that is existent or both existent and non-existent.

करोति सदसद्भूतो न सन्नासच्च कारकः ।

कर्म तच्च विजानीयत्पूर्वोक्तेरेव हेतुभिह् ॥ ११

B: One who neither exists nor does not exist as an actor does not do that which exists and does not exist as an act. Here too this is to be known through the proof demonstrated above.

S: And a real-non-real producer does not produce a product which is neither real nor non-real.

This is evident from the reasons which have been advanced earlier.

G: An existent and nonexistent agent does not perform an action that is unreal or both real and unreal as we have agreed.

I: A completed-incompleter doer cannot create either a completed or incompleter deed. That is to be known by the reason stated previously (i.e. verse 7).

K: An agent that has come to be both existent and non-existent does not perform an action that exists and does not exist. This too should be understood in terms of the reasons adduced above.

प्रतीत्य कारकः कर्म तं प्रतीत्य च कारकम् ।

कर्म प्रवर्तते नान्यत्पश्यामः सिद्धिकारणं ॥ १२

B: An actor depends on acts and acts too occur in dependence on an actor. Apart from this, one does not see a cause which is established.

SB: Actors depend on acts and acts depend on actors – I cannot see it otherwise.

S: The producer proceeds being dependent on the product, and the product proceeds being dependent on the producer.

The cause for realization (i.e. Nirvana) is seen in nothing else.

G: Action depends upon the agent. The agent itself depends on action. One cannot see any way to establish them differently.

I: The doer is dynamically related to the deed and the deed to the doer in order to arise. We cannot perceive any other cause for their establishment or completion.

K: An agent proceeds depending upon action and action proceeds depending upon the agent. We do not perceive any other way of establishing [them].

एवं विद्यादुपादानं व्युत्सर्गादिति कर्मणः ।

कर्तुश्च कर्मकर्तृभ्यां शेषान् भावान् विद्भावेत् ॥ १३

B: Likewise, one should understand clinging, because act and actor are dispelled. Remaining things too should be understood by means of actor and act.

SB: When acts and actors vanish, you understand clinging and everything else.

S: In the same way one should understand the "acquiring" (i.e. of karma - upadana) on the basis of the "giving up," etc. of the producer and the product.

By means of [this analysis of] the product and the producer all other things should be dissolved.

G: From this elimination of agent and action, one should elucidate appropriation in the same way. Through action and agent all remaining things should be understood.

I: Thus, by way of refutation of the (static concepts of the) doer and the deed, the concept of seizing or clinging (upadana) can be known. And basing the analysis on both the doer and the deed, various other entities (i.e. phenomena) can be understood.

K: Following this method of the rejection of agent and action, one should understand grasping. The remaining existents should be critically examined in terms of the concepts of action and agent.